
NIAGARA GORGE CORRIDOR PUBLIC INPUT SESSION

November 30, 2010

taken at

NIAGARA FALLS PUBLIC LIBRARY

PRESENT: ROBERT SHIBLEY.

 ANDREA P. EGOLF,
 Court Reporter.

1 MR. THOMAS: My name is Mark Thomas. I'm
2 the Western District Director for the
3 Office of New York State Office of
4 Recreation Parks and Historic
5 Preservation. And on behalf of Governor
6 Paterson and our acting commissioner,
7 Andy Beers, I'm here this evening to
8 start our public meeting for the scoping
9 Niagara River Gorge Corridor and the
10 Robert Moses Parkway and other
11 transportation structures in that
12 corridor.

13 I want to introduce some people who
14 are here with us in terms of elected
15 officials and/or the representatives this
16 evening so that you know they are in the
17 room.

18 First of all, I want to thank the
19 Mayor of Niagara Falls, Paul Dyster, who
20 is here this evening. Paul, thank you
21 for providing the library and its
22 facility.

23 In addition, one of other partners

1 in the planning process in addition to
2 the city is here, we have two
3 representatives from USA Niagara and that
4 is Chris Cheflinn and Paul Tronolone, who
5 is up in the back corner here. Thank you
6 for your work here.

7 Third is Ken Kaminski, who is here
8 from the New York State Department of
9 Transportation, who is our state partner.
10 There he is there up in the back. Ken
11 represents the DOT this evening. Thank
12 you.

13 And from the communities here in
14 Niagara County along the gorge corridor I
15 want to introduce, I believe he's still
16 here, Steve Writer, who is the town
17 supervisor from Lewiston. Steve, thank
18 you for being here this evening. And
19 Mike Mayor is a councilman here speaking
20 for Steve, as Steve has another
21 engagement and has to leave before we get
22 to that part this evening. Thank you,
23 gentlemen.

1 In addition we have from the Town of
2 Porter, Tom Bye is representing the Town
3 of Porter. Tom, thank you. And we have
4 Bruce Southerland, who is the mayor of
5 the Village of Lewiston as well out there
6 in back with. And we have with us this
7 evening Jim Ward representing our senator
8 for this good portion of this region and
9 that is Senator Gorge Maziarz. Thank you
10 for being here there evening and also
11 Senator Maziarz is in session in Albany
12 and will be joining us before the evening
13 is out, and I wanted to make sure you
14 realize he's on his way here and doing
15 everything he can to get here for the
16 session as well, but work in Albany
17 called him there this week.

18 And without any further adu, I've
19 got through the local officials along the
20 gorge here and if I missed someone, I
21 apologize.

22 This evening we are moving further
23 down the road towards putting together

1 what is called a scoping document for the
2 Niagara Gorge Corridor and beginning to
3 get ideas as we go on in the program, and
4 we will be able to hear from you and you
5 will have plenty of opportunity to
6 participate this evening through a
7 variety of means.

8 One of the things that in the four
9 years I've been here at the Niagara Parks
10 that has impressed me with the Niagara --
11 Greater Niagara Communities is the
12 passion by which people hold their
13 positions and opinions and that is based
14 on thoughtful and well-thought through
15 positions. I think that's one of the
16 greatest strengths to this region, people
17 participate, and look at the full
18 auditorium here, you get the message loud
19 and clear that people want to participate
20 and do want opportunities to be a part of
21 what happens in their communities.

22 We also this evening have the
23 opportunity to listen to each other and

1 learn from each other, and that is one of
2 the most important parts about this
3 scoping process, as well.

4 I've also seen over time in my
5 position at the state and my former life
6 as an elected official, that the support
7 is needed for projects to advance, once
8 they're formed it requires that there is
9 a broad-based consensus based around a
10 direction, and that from that consensus
11 private and public dollars can be brought
12 to bear to improve the infrastructure and
13 the quality of life in the communities.

14 And with that being said, we also
15 have, as well, the need to preserve and
16 be stewards of an environment, a precious
17 environment that is here, and those two
18 objectives, economic and environmental
19 can be achieved together. Throughout our
20 country we have seen more and more
21 opportunities where those used to be only
22 divergent opinions can also come together
23 and form coalitions and coalescing into

1 ideas and investment that revitalizes and
2 grows communities.

3 So we stand here this evening in the
4 moment of opportunity in front of you
5 here in the Greater Niagara Community,
6 and I ask that we seize that moment
7 together and that we find ways from this
8 process that we can begin revitalizing
9 and develop this area in new and exciting
10 ways that will continue to serve not only
11 the generation of people that sit here in
12 the room this evening, but the many
13 generations that are to come.

14 Thank you for your spending the
15 evening with us tonight and we will move
16 this process along. I have a number of
17 gentlemen who will be here this evening
18 conducting the hearing's events and I
19 wanted to first introduce to you Bob
20 Shibley, who is one of the consultants,
21 and he is one of the deans from UB in his
22 day job, and his evening work that he
23 does throughout Western New York, he's a

1 very effective leader of public meetings
2 and so we've invited Bob to be leader of
3 this meeting, this hearing, because of
4 his experience both here in Niagara and
5 throughout Western New York.

6 HEARING DIRECTOR: My three-year-old
7 granddaughter said, when did you change
8 your name, you're not Dean Bob.

9 Folks, welcome. Thanks for coming
10 out on a rainy night and thanks for not
11 checking your passion at the door. I
12 suspect it would be impossible to have
13 you do that anyway.

14 My job is to give you, at this
15 juncture, to give you a little bit of the
16 shape on how this meeting is going to
17 occur, let you know how the agenda is
18 going to function and how we're going to
19 create opportunities to get input from
20 you in a variety of ways. Our goal is to
21 aim the consultant team at the creation
22 of the best approach to the Gorge
23 Corridor that we can, and we're going to

1 do that by listening a lot and not making
2 sort of long speeches and dissertations.
3 That's an admonition to us and our team
4 to not make long speeches and it is a
5 request of us to you to not make long
6 speeches because there is a lot of you.
7 But I could imagine that if you've
8 written material or you have comment
9 sheets you might indeed want to write
10 more carefully and thoughtfully.

11 We're going to structure this in a
12 way to get into this conversation kind of
13 giving you an overview of the meeting
14 goals and where we see ourselves head
15 here. Part of that is going to be a test
16 of a little technology that you got when
17 you checked in. These clickers are going
18 to help us understand more completely who
19 is in the room, where they come from, and
20 then we're going to talk about the ground
21 rules involved.

22 You're going to get a discussion
23 then of where this project is in the

1 process, what the -- what the location in
2 scheduling goes. And if you follow this
3 kind of work and looked at some of the
4 diagrams out there or read the diagram
5 in the little brochure you got, you get a
6 headache first, and then second you will
7 realize that we're fairly early in the
8 process. The project scoping means
9 aiming the consultant team at the proper
10 objectives. They have a first draft, it
11 is rough, it is imperfect, they're eager
12 to get your comments on it to sharpen and
13 to represent the range of values that we
14 have in this community.

15 So project scoping, the process and
16 consent will be a presentation of the
17 consulting team and they will deliver and
18 they will talk to you a little bit how
19 they got to the first draft, who they
20 spoke with, how they spoke to them, what
21 they learned from that process, what they
22 think they learned, because I'm sure you
23 will want to correct it, and we will go

1 through the process from sort of what got
2 us to here tonight. And then there will
3 be a representation of what those initial
4 project objectives are, the way in which
5 you want to measure success on the
6 corridor project. And so we will think
7 about that and that will take us into
8 some concluding thoughts and
9 discussions.

10 I'm a teacher, that's what I do, so
11 we're going to get past that presentation
12 of first draft objectives and then we're
13 going to have a test, we're going to see
14 how you feel about it, what you thought
15 about the various aspects of it. Some of
16 you will feel very strongly about it and
17 you will find yourself in the minority
18 in the way we're going to ask questions.
19 The opportunity is for us to explore
20 everyone's opinions. So we will ask for
21 some minority opinions, we'll ask for
22 some middle, we're asking for some in the
23 majority. So we will start to work the

1 room to try and hear those various points
2 of view.

3 Again, encouragement there is to
4 sort of remember that all ideas and
5 suggestions are welcome here tonight,
6 there is no wrong suggestion or opinion,
7 we're listening and recording, and when I
8 say recording, there is a stenographer
9 here, pretty soon when you start talking
10 that stenographer will keep going and
11 people working these newspaper pieces and
12 because they have the good sense to hire
13 an academic to read every word, that will
14 come back to you and we'll reflect it and
15 we will report it back to you.

16 The identification of alternatives
17 is a good thing to do. And the idea that
18 you disagree with one isn't the point of
19 tonight, it is to hear what those various
20 different points of view and alternatives
21 might be, to listen and understand both
22 what is said to you about where we are in
23 the process, and what those objectives

1 might mean and to hear from you about
2 your opinions about that. So we're
3 asking for respect in a civil discourse
4 here and we're trying to be fair with
5 time, so watch your clock, watch your
6 time. We're not going to click you off
7 or put the hook on you, but we might
8 start walking towards and you say it is
9 time for somebody else to get time to
10 talk.

11 Having said that, I was struck by
12 the way this was advertised. I saw this
13 in the Saturday Buffalo Paper, started
14 out with Lewiston Looks at Parkway
15 Options, that was the announcement for
16 tonights event, followed by, Lewiston
17 Prepares for the War of 1812. I just
18 thought I'd share that, that was all on
19 the same page.

20 Thoughts we identified tonight are
21 to identify, not to deconstruct or to
22 decide about solutions. We're really
23 starting the process by opening the range

1 of ways of thinking about this corridor
2 that should be considered before we go
3 forward. The question is -- questions
4 are meant to help define or understand
5 input and all of those questions are
6 going to be useful to us. We're asking
7 for your kind of air time discipline, be
8 concise by all means. There is some
9 questions on the survey form you got, if
10 you don't like the questions, turn it
11 over and write whatever you want. That
12 is okay too, there is a space on the back
13 for that. If we can do it, we'll try to
14 minimize sidebar conversations so we keep
15 our attention focused on each other, not
16 in four or five ways. One reason for
17 that is we can't capture value from those
18 conversations the way we can this way.

19 Now, when you came in they gave you
20 this little clicker thing. First thing I
21 want to say is I want it back when you
22 leave. Each one of worth about
23 twenty-five bucks and we'll hunt you

1 down. But try to remember, they're easy
2 to slip in a pocket or something and
3 forget about and you will see somebody
4 running after you if you head out with
5 one.

6 The way this works is you take your
7 clickers out, you will see that one of
8 the first questions is to figure out who
9 is in the room, who is here tonight.
10 We've got concerned citizens,
11 neighborhood organizations or
12 not-for-profit organizations or local
13 businesses or government representatives
14 or are you other, and you just push the
15 number next to what you are, and if
16 you're five or six things, that is okay,
17 but push the one you want to register for
18 tonight in terms of how you are
19 represented. And you know what, it
20 doesn't matter, it just gives us a
21 general idea of the various people that
22 are in the room. So if you push the
23 button, I see forty-four -- you can count

1 the folks here. It is another way of
2 taking role. One hundred thirteen, one
3 fifteen, twenty-four. My goal is to be
4 able to say push your button and actually
5 see one hundred fifty things up there
6 immediately. Not going to happen. One
7 fifty. Is it a hard question? I know,
8 it takes a long time. We know something
9 we didn't know before, we have one
10 hundred sixty-one -- sixty-five. Okay,
11 are we done? Here we go, going once,
12 twice, three times, now we check. Next
13 time we will go faster.

14 So sixty-seven percent are here
15 representing themselves as concerned
16 citizens. Another five percent are
17 neighborhood organizations. You've got
18 nine percent are not-for-profit
19 organizations. Seven and seven, local
20 businesses and government. And five
21 percent are other.

22 So just to help us out, some of you
23 are other, who are you, where are you

1 from, what is your thinking?

2 SPEAKER: My grandfather used to own
3 elevators down in the gorge going back to
4 the park land.

5 MR. SHIBLEY: I'm the great great grandson of
6 an elevator operator. Good. What else?

7 SPEAKER: I'm your bread and butter, I'm a
8 Canadian tourist.

9 MR. SHIBLEY: God bless you Canadian
10 tourists. So you get an idea about how
11 it works. See if it can going faster on
12 this one, even harder question. Are you
13 male, female or other? All are welcome,
14 that's okay. How many did we have last
15 time? So you know, I want to apologize
16 for not getting the transgender group
17 out, I'm sorry. We'll try to do better,
18 I know it is important. But I do think
19 it is useful to look at this split, sixty
20 forty male, female. Usually in my kind
21 of work that means it is going to be a
22 less civil discourse. I'm confident I'll
23 be proven wrong tonight.

1 This is one that helps us with the
2 sort of racial distribution. Often we
3 work in communities where we are trying
4 to represent community values and we look
5 at the demographics of a region and we
6 get one set of numbers and we look at
7 something else and we get another set of
8 numbers. And it is useful just to have
9 this occurring to know what those
10 differences are.

11 So let's see what we look like as a
12 group tonight. Some of more interesting
13 ones that we do at the University of
14 Buffalo is when we get to other because
15 they just come from all over the world.
16 Thank you. One fifty-seven. Struggling
17 with this one. I bet if I poled the
18 census track information about everybody
19 related to the corridor it won't look
20 like that. So one thing that tells our
21 consultant team is that they have to find
22 other ways to access a broader audience.

23 You don't have to lie, it is

1 anonymous. Just put it out there. Let's
2 see where we are. This goes again to
3 what is the demographic of your region,
4 where are our children, where are the
5 young teens, where are the twenty to
6 thirty range, what is your age? Who has
7 two clickers? We seem to taking on new
8 people. So ladies and gentlemen, I'm
9 sixty-four, I've got five kids and eight
10 grandkids, I'm proud to live in the
11 region and glad to be among so many
12 friends. So fifty-six percent of us are,
13 and if you put this in relationship to
14 sixty-seven percent are concerned
15 citizens and this is senior citizens
16 doing what we should be doing is weighing
17 in on serious issues in our region, so
18 thank you all for being here.

19 Then we look how this drops off in
20 kind of a steep curve, the next class of
21 folks are what I used to think was old,
22 fifty to fifty-nine, and then eleven
23 percent, forty to forty-nine, and then we

1 just tank at the thirties, twenties and
2 nineteen and under.

3 And again, it sort of says to us,
4 well, if we think we're talking as a
5 group about the values of our entire
6 community, we have to recognize that we
7 got a certain set of the biases built
8 into how old we are and how long we live
9 and what we think about.

10 Now, this is important because it
11 has to do with how did we get you here
12 and how do we think about getting a wider
13 cross section of people here over time,
14 but useful to get a sense of how did you
15 arrive, did you hear about this meeting
16 through e-mail, radio, newspaper,
17 posters, word of mouth, website, social
18 media, other. Sometimes the most useful
19 one is other. So we'll see where it
20 takes us. You can only do one, but do
21 the one that really convinced you to
22 come.

23 The big winner here is newspaper.

1 That is -- that is interesting. And then
2 number six, word of mouth, and then the
3 e-mail and mail kind of fifteen and
4 twelve percent. You can see how we read
5 this. And then on the far end there is
6 seven percent. Help us with other. What
7 are the other ways you heard about coming
8 here tonight, just shout it out.

9 SPEAKER: Business organization.

10 MR. SHIBLEY: Thank you.

11 SPEAKER: Conversation with consultant.

12 MR. SHIBLEY: Anything else? All the way in
13 the back.

14 SPEAKER: Our teacher.

15 MR. SHIBLEY: You're part of that two
16 percent. Thank you for coming. And then
17 this gets down closer to the wire here,
18 what are we doing here? I'm here because
19 I have a general interest in the Niagara
20 Gorge Corridor. I'm here to advocate for
21 my view of responsible action on the
22 corridor. I didn't have anything else to
23 do on a Wednesday night or Tuesday. It

1 says weekday night. And then I don't
2 know, I thought they were showing you
3 movies at the library tonight. Whatever,
4 whatever feels or strikes your fancy.
5 The harder questions always take longer.
6 You can push these things as how often as
7 you like, only the last one counts. You
8 can change your vote if you want to.
9 Did we lose two already? Chase them
10 down, I want those clickers back.

11 We've got seventy-one percent to
12 advocate for my view on the corridor.
13 We've got general interest in Niagara
14 Gorge. Seventy-one percent advocating
15 for my view, and then, by the way, there
16 is the rest of the folks who are here
17 because they are really interested in the
18 gorge and probably have something to say
19 as well.

20 We're going to put a little
21 information out that kind of frames what
22 a scoping session is and how it works in
23 the process, where we are and the overall

1 sequence of things and what sorts of
2 objectives are emerging so far, then
3 we're going to start asking you some
4 questions about those objectives.

5 Essentially we're going to try and
6 understand from your perspective whether
7 it is as an advocate or someone with
8 general interest as to whether or not
9 we're on the right track. And if not,
10 why not, because that is what we really
11 take the meaningful notes and start to
12 sharpen it. Is everybody with me on this
13 process.

14 Where do you live? Let the folks
15 know where you live. Niagara Falls,
16 twenty-eight percent of you. Lewiston,
17 thirty-eight percent. Youngstown,
18 twenty-three percent of you. And then
19 elsewhere in Niagara County, Erie
20 County, other, from Canada. Any other
21 place other than our Canadian guest?

22 SPEAKER: I'm from Rochester.

23 MR. SHIBLEY: Welcome. Thank you for the

1 trip.

2 Ladies and gentlemen, I'd like to
3 now introduce to you one of the really
4 smart people we hired, Tom Donohue. He
5 will give you kind of an orientation on
6 the corridor project, where we are in the
7 process and this is the material you will
8 be tested on after the presentation, so
9 take good notes thank you.

10 MR. DONOHUE: Thank you, Bob. Briefly on the
11 process, this process will take about six
12 major steps. Project identification was
13 accomplished to the Buffalo Greater --
14 Greater Buffalo Niagara Region
15 Transportation Council which identified
16 the basic need for the project. The
17 project was then initialized by the
18 project sponsors, which secured the
19 funding for the spoken face of the
20 project and set the project limits.

21 The project scoping phase we are
22 currently undertaking, and I'll get into
23 that in a moment, this will be followed

1 by the preliminary design and detailed
2 environmental studies. These detail stud
3 studies will be conducted on those
4 alternatives that come out of this
5 scoping process.

6 A record of the decision is made --
7 a record of the decision is made at the
8 conclusion of that phase which will
9 determine what the final project looks
10 like. Final design of the selective
11 alternative can then start and followed
12 by construction.

13 What does project scoping mean
14 anyway? This is a phase where we gather
15 project information, we consider other
16 projects that may be ongoing, we gain an
17 understanding of what the project
18 concerns and issues are, we determine
19 what are the purpose needs and objectives
20 of the project. We can start to develop
21 the concepts that will hopefully satisfy
22 those project objectives. We will take a
23 general look at what socioeconomic and

1 environmental issues may be affected by
2 those concepts. We will get a
3 stakeholder and public input on those
4 concepts that will initially develop. We
5 then hope to make a recommendation on
6 which of those concepts should be
7 advanced for more detail studies in the
8 next phase.

9 Finally we document our entire
10 scoping process in our report. The
11 project study area are the limits for the
12 project will be Main Street in Niagara
13 Falls on the south and Route 104 in
14 Lewiston on the north. The corridor or
15 study area includes the Robert Moses
16 Parkway, the entire area between the
17 river on the west, and Main Street and
18 Lewiston Road on the east.

19 For our traffic studies, we will be
20 including additional highways where
21 traffic may be rerouted. This may be
22 necessary, the concept requires streets
23 that are currently unconnected to be

1 reconnected or if existing streets that
2 are open need to be closed. The map
3 highlights or routes that would be
4 included in this traffic study.

5 The project schedule shows we have
6 completed the initial stakeholder
7 meetings and tonight is our first public
8 meeting. Over the next several months we
9 will start developing those concepts for
10 the corridor, which will include a wide
11 range of ideas.

12 In the spring of next year we should
13 have a traffic report and will hold more
14 stakeholder public meetings to go over
15 these concepts and explain how they were
16 developed. Based on input received at
17 those meetings, we will finalize the
18 report and present to you those concepts
19 that would be recommended for more detail
20 studies in the next phase. This will
21 conclude in scoping phase of the project
22 as we begin the next phase which looks at
23 the alternatives in more detail.

1 Additional opportunities for public input
2 will be made available, including
3 additional meetings, informal SEQR and
4 public meetings.

5 In order to have a good
6 understanding of what issues are
7 important regarding this project we have
8 held four stakeholder meetings thus far,
9 they include the MOU group, the
10 department of parks, New York DOT, USA
11 Niagara and City of Niagara Falls. And
12 what MOU stands for is memorandum of
13 understanding, which was a document
14 signed by the group which helped to
15 secure the funding for the scoping phase
16 of this project. And currently there is
17 only funding available for this phase.
18 The other three meetings were composed of
19 local government groups, agencies and
20 elected officials and cultural and
21 commercial and environmental groups.

22 There is a listing of individual
23 agencies that attended the stakeholder

1 meetings, they provided us with incites,
2 as well as well-rounded understanding of
3 what they feel are important issues and
4 concerns that we should be aware of
5 during our study. Altogether we listened
6 to forty-two agencies and groups, each
7 having a specific interest in the
8 project. These groups will be referred
9 to as stakeholders. We have copies of
10 the minutes from each of those meetings,
11 along with copies of written statements
12 provided by the groups and individual so
13 far.

14 Why do we have the initial meetings
15 in the first place? To obtain relevant
16 project data that the agencies may have
17 for us, to gain understanding on what
18 issues are important and to begin to
19 develop a set of project objectives, to
20 get ahold of any information on parallel
21 planning efforts that the agency may be
22 undertaking, and see if there are
23 alternatives that the groups may want to

1 propose.

2 We have learned a lot -- we have
3 heard a lot from many people on many
4 topics so far. We have started a
5 collection of previous reports and
6 letters submitted by agencies, groups and
7 individuals and a sample of our
8 collection is out in the lobby. I would
9 like to highlight just a few of the
10 issues we have heard so far. Believe me,
11 this is not a complete list, this just
12 touches the top of it. We have
13 definitely heard there is strong support
14 from both parkway removal and parkway
15 preservation. We have heard there could
16 be impact to the economy of the region
17 with and without a parkway. Traffic
18 issues were raised that affect Artpark,
19 local schools, neighborhoods, hospitals,
20 and traffic heading to and from Canada.
21 Environmental issues range from storm
22 water runoff caused by the parkway, to
23 preservation and enhancement of wildlife

1 and habitats. Issues were also raised
2 concerning providing better access to the
3 gorge and maintaining a transportation
4 link between Niagara Falls and points
5 north, which leads me to project
6 objectives. What the heck are they.

7 They are basically general
8 statements of what we would like to
9 accomplish with this project. Who really
10 gets to make these up? Well, they were
11 initiated by project sponsors and
12 adjusted to stakeholder input and
13 ultimately by you and me here. And why
14 do we need them? They are really going
15 to gauge how well alternatives satisfies
16 what we wanted to accomplish.

17 I'd like to try to hit this as an
18 example here with the project and how we
19 are using it for measurement. Imagine we
20 have a total of seven objectives listed
21 along the left side of this here graphic
22 and eight alternatives are options listed
23 along the top. We'll rate each of the

1 options against each of the objectives.
2 Options may rate better for some and
3 poorer for others. Examples here shows
4 the red mark would indicate that the
5 alternative did not meet the objective.
6 A yellow mark somewhat satisfied. And a
7 green mark completely satisfied it. When
8 we use a rating system like this one, it
9 would appear like something you would see
10 produced by a consumer report.

11 We can also use a numerical system
12 and rate each option score on a one to
13 ten for each of the objectives. The
14 bottom line here is we will be using this
15 type of measurement to select those
16 options that score higher to be advanced
17 in the next phase. Those options that do
18 not measure up to the most of the
19 objectives will be dropped from further
20 consideration.

21 That leads us to the objectives
22 themselves, and we have got nine of them.
23 Our first stakeholder meeting we

1 developed a draft set on the objectives.
2 We came up with nine and shared them with
3 all the stakeholders we have met so far
4 for input and feedback. Once again,
5 these are general statements that
6 describe what we will like the project to
7 accomplish and these are objectives, they
8 pretty much are as they stand today and
9 are listed in back of your handout. This
10 is what you're going to be quizzed on
11 later. But the first one, I'll read it,
12 the first one that we came up with out
13 there, remove the excess transportation
14 infrastructure that currently exist
15 within the Niagara Gorge Corridor. Key
16 words obviously are excess transportation
17 infrastructure. Someone is going to
18 wonder, for example, eight years ago,
19 seven years we took a majority of the
20 corridor, took all the traffic and put it
21 on one half of the existing highway and
22 left the other half pretty much as it is
23 today. That could be considered excess,

1 it could be more or less than that.

2 The second one is a long one and I
3 will read it through first, but it has to
4 do with public transportation linkages
5 which is kind of contrary to removing,
6 but let me read this through. Provide
7 appropriately scaled, direct, continuous
8 and integrated improvements to the
9 vehicular, bicycle, pedestrian and public
10 transportation linkages between the
11 points of interest, whether scenic,
12 natural, cultural, and historic
13 attractions, along the Niagara Gorge
14 Corridor and within adjacent communities,
15 neighborhoods and business districts.

16 Once again, his is really focusing
17 on the public transportation linkages.

18 The third one is really talking
19 about connections to the communities and
20 roads, create new and enhanced existing
21 connections with the adjacent community
22 and the Niagara Gorge Corridor.

23 Going to four, it is a short one,

1 but remove the excess -- no, I didn't
2 flip the page. Enhance opportunities for
3 appropriately scaled uses within the
4 Niagara Gorge Corridor by expanding the
5 park experience up to and into the
6 adjoining community.

7 And what is appropriately scaled
8 uses, and it is really referring to
9 making opportunities for economic
10 development, and what is really
11 appropriately scaled uses, would it be
12 the whole line of forty story apartment
13 buildings along the gorge or would it be
14 a little hut someplace that someone could
15 rent a bike, but that is kind of like the
16 extremes.

17 Number five reads, provide
18 improvement pedestrian access throughout
19 the Niagara Gorge Corridor.

20 Six, provide multi-model
21 recreational trails throughout the length
22 of the corridor to points of interest and
23 community destinations.

1 Conserve, rehabilitate and protect
2 the natural setting of the Niagara Gorge
3 Corridor.

4 Number eight, improve the visitors'
5 and residents' experience both in the
6 park and in the adjacent community.

7 And number nine, support the Niagara
8 River Greenway's vision by providing
9 access to and connections between the
10 important resources within the corridor,
11 giving rise to economic opportunities for
12 the region.

13 Once again, these are all on the
14 brochure. I would like to turn the
15 meeting back to Bob to complete the
16 presentation. Thank you.

17 HEARING DIRECTOR: I will ask my colleagues
18 to come down, pick up the mics so we can
19 get going, and let's take the first
20 question in the back on measurement as a
21 point of clarification. If you would
22 raise your hand.

23 SPEAKER: I don't need the mic. In regard to

1 measurement, is this going to be
2 predetermined rankings so that if you
3 have X number of reds are they
4 automatically -- is that option to be
5 automatically (inaudible). How is that
6 going to work?

7 MR. SHIBLEY: I think what I'm going to do is
8 talk about that in relationship to the
9 objective. You're talking to a group of
10 engineers who can't manage what they
11 can't measure. So the method of
12 measurement is real. This is an example
13 you can quantify, you can do a number of
14 things, so what? The issue is, how do we
15 state an objective so we understand how
16 to measure it and I think that is part of
17 the conversation, so we have got the
18 measurement question up there so that is
19 something that has to be clarified as we
20 go forward.

21 I'll take a few questions for
22 clarification and then I really want to
23 dig into the value piece. So I'm going

1 to ask you, sir, would you do that for
2 me?

3 GARY WINTERS: Gary Winters. Question, first
4 define US Niagara and who composed that
5 group? Secondly, the definition of the
6 corridor? You said Route 104 on the
7 north. Actually, it is the Moses Parkway
8 on the north.

9 MR. SHIBLEY: We will report both of those
10 for clarification as we go forward.
11 Thank you, sir. Other questions or
12 clarification?

13 SPEAKER: I'm worried about the last one
14 where it says, giving rise to economic
15 opportunities for the region. It doesn't
16 mean that you're going allow the
17 development on either side of the
18 corridor in form of hotels, motels and
19 restaurants and that kind of stuff?

20 MR. SHIBLEY: I think what we're going to try
21 to do now is get into exactly what those
22 things meant. Let's take a look and see
23 here, let's just think about what you

1 just heard about objectives. Some
2 points of clarification about
3 measurement, about the definition of
4 terms, about who the actors are and about
5 what each of the phrases actually means.

6 The questions we're asking just to
7 get a feel for is in the range of
8 objectives you just heard and reviewed
9 and written on the back panel of your
10 handout when you came in, are these basic
11 objectives basically sound, do they need
12 minor adjustments, do they need to be
13 significantly adjusted, or are they
14 fatally flawed, should we started all
15 over, or five, it is too soon to tell, I
16 don't know yet. And based on the way we
17 see the spread in the room we'll start
18 asking questions about, why do you think
19 it needs adjustment, what kind of
20 adjustment, or is it fatally flawed
21 throughout the whole thing out. So let's
22 see where we're going with that. This is
23 the moment of truth.

1 So we're going to have a
2 conversation about it for those of you
3 who think it is fatally flawed, we will
4 go to that first. Fatally flawed, start
5 over again. Let me see a hand. On this
6 side of the room, anybody over there on
7 this side? Step up and come over to the
8 mic.

9 STEVE JACKSON: Steve Jackson.
10 Youngstown, New York. My grandparents
11 lived here their whole life. My grandpa
12 was an artist. I've drove up and down
13 the Robert Moses Parkway, when you made
14 it a walkway, that was a good idea. You
15 shouldn't have took the road away. You
16 did it in Youngstown, you did it in
17 Lewiston, it is beautiful the way it is.
18 Why do you try to change anything?

19 MR. SHIBLEY: You're saying the project is
20 fatally flawed, make the whole project go
21 away. Got it. Message received. Thank
22 you. Anybody on this side, fatally
23 flawed? One right here.

1 NANCY CAPELLO: Nancy Capello. Youngstown.

2 And right from the beginning when they
3 closed off the half of the parkway, that
4 was flawed. They had a hiking trail,
5 they could have improved that. I think
6 they should go back to opening up the
7 part they closed and have both roads.

8 MR. SHIBLEY: Well, that's a project, so then
9 within the project there is excess or
10 not, we take it back to the way it is.
11 Thank you very much.

12 MR. SHIBLEY: Anybody else in the fatally
13 flawed? Straight back. Sandy, thank
14 you.

15 SPEAKER: I'm from Welland, Ontario. It is a
16 very dysfunctional town, coming from
17 Niagara Falls, New York, I'm very much at
18 home over here. I'm here four months of
19 the year. I was a marketing major in the
20 university. You have a gem here. There
21 is nothing wrong with the Robert Moses,
22 Niagara Falls and Fort Niagara that
23 polishing, spiffing up and you could

1 equal Canada. What you have failed in is
2 marketing. This has a world class drive
3 along the border of two countries with a
4 tremendous (inaudible). If you take some
5 bushes, some old fashion light posts that
6 hang over both sides, a lookout over
7 Lewiston (inaudible).

8 MR. SHIBLEY: Message received. What we have
9 here, however, is a project and you just
10 started and articulated objectives for
11 it. Thank you, sir.

12 SPEAKER: What I feel is --

13 MR. SHIBLEY: Please, this is a great group,
14 you've been trying to mention your name,
15 the stenographer is trying to keep track
16 of who is speaking.

17 SPEAKER: What I feel is --

18 MR. SHIBLEY: Can you state your name, sir?

19 HAROLD NELSON: Harold Nelson. What I feel
20 is looking at the Robert Moses Parkway
21 from the Grand Island bridge north, and
22 up to Niagara Falls, if they took that
23 out and made it the same way, they

1 wouldn't have to go up Buffalo Avenue,
2 which I think the city would be really
3 glad about that.

4 MR. SHIBLEY: Once again we ever another
5 project in a different kind of
6 performance objective. Thank you very
7 much. Take one more in the center here
8 and we will try some others.

9 CARMELLA AMADI: My name is Carmella Amadi
10 and I live in the Village of Lewiston. I
11 am a native of Niagara Falls, lived in
12 Lewiston about thirty-five years and I
13 love Lewiston, but I think I have
14 suffered so long going on that Robert
15 Moses. I've written a number of letters
16 to the editor and I'm not in favor of you
17 tearing down the road because I go to my
18 doctor, my dentist, and other
19 environmental places that are necessary
20 and I think those barrels we have
21 suffered with for fifteen some years
22 should never have come to place.

23 MR. SHIBLEY: So we have a project, take the

1 barrels down, put it back the way it was.
2 Thank you very much. Shifting focus a
3 little bit. We now have about twenty-one
4 percent in the room who have said to us
5 it's basically sound. Ladies and
6 gentlemen, would it be possible for
7 folks, some are saying it is sound, some
8 say I think it stinks and we can have a
9 yelling match. That doesn't buy us
10 anything. What we are trying to do is
11 record nuances of ideas and the process
12 of ideas behind is. So if you think it
13 is basically sound, let's hear from you.
14 Right behind you, Sandy.

15 MICHELLE BANSTROM: Michelle Banstrom, I'm
16 president of Wild Ones Niagara. I live
17 in Youngstown, New York and I have a
18 business in Niagara Falls. I think
19 basically what you have done is an
20 outstanding, difficult job. What I would
21 like to see is a clear indication that
22 removal will be an option. I represent
23 four thousand individuals that have

1 signed a petition stating from all over
2 the world, they're Youngstown, Lewiston
3 from Niagara Falls, they're from Deveux,
4 they're from around the world, and they
5 want to see an option considered for
6 removal. Thanks.

7 MR. SHIBLEY: Thank you. Someone else who
8 things we're basically on the right
9 track.

10 CHRISTOPHER BROWN: Christopher Brown, 4590
11 College Avenue, the Deveux section of
12 Niagara Falls. I also think the
13 objectives are basically sound and I
14 think they could be met by a compromise
15 that would eliminate part of parkway from
16 Main Street next to, near the Rainbow
17 Bridge up to Finley Drive, and I think if
18 you used Whirlpool Street as an
19 alternative that would be great, keep the
20 continuous flow of traffic from Niagara
21 Falls into the northern towns and
22 villages.

23 I think it is something that, you

1 know, from a regional tourism mecca that
2 we really are, to cut off this link would
3 be a dramatic departure from that. And I
4 think as a resident of Deveux, to have
5 the traffic and the whole parkway were
6 removed, have the traffic flow onto
7 Lewiston Road would be a detriment to our
8 neighborhood, which it works very well
9 the way it is. So I see nothing but
10 major advantages in your objectives to
11 keep the continuous flow of cars and
12 tourists.

13 MR. SHIBLEY: Noted and recorded. Thank you,
14 sir. We have one right behind you.

15 DAVE FLECK: First of all I'm handicapped.

16 (Inaudible.)

17 MR. SHIBLEY: Perfect, sir. I'm going to ask
18 you at the end of the session to join my
19 colleagues and go over that because I
20 think it was hard to catch all of that
21 and I want to make sure we get that.
22 Thank you very much.

23 Do we have others who are in the

1 category of basically sound?

2 CHARLES SANDERS: Charles Sanders from
3 Niagara Falls. I think the people from
4 Lewiston got Lewiston Road, Hyde Park,
5 Main Street, so many roads to get to
6 Niagara Falls, I don't really care what
7 they do with the gorge in Lewiston, I
8 think the Park in Niagara Falls should be
9 removed. I've been going through gorge
10 since I was a little kid. (Inaudible).
11 I've been walking through the gorge from
12 this area and from Spring Street, and I
13 think it should be removed in Niagara
14 Falls.

15 MR. SHIBLEY: Folks, I'm going to ask that we
16 let the speaker talk and not applaud
17 because it is hard to hear.

18 If we keep saying take it out, put
19 it in, take it out, we're going to get
20 board if that's all we're going to hear.
21 Let's see if we can get more precise on
22 where this is going. Some of you said it
23 needs minor adjustments. I'm guess you

1 have something specific in mind, help us
2 with the kind of minor adjustments you
3 would like to see. This young lady right
4 here.

5 ELAINE MANCINI: My name is Elaine Mancini
6 and the freeway/parkway has always been,
7 they say it was a mistake to build it in
8 the first place, but I myself feel that
9 it is our lifeline to keep Niagara Falls.
10 It is the only thing that we can do,
11 because if you get people who are in the
12 Falls and they don't even know that there
13 is anything up north and they ask is that
14 all there is after they see the main
15 attractions? Well, we got so much to
16 offer going to the north and so I feel
17 that it needs a minor adjustment. I feel
18 that if there was some kind of trolley
19 and focus on that trolley and stop --
20 there are fifteen stops from the aquarium
21 all the way to Wilson, there are fifteen
22 stops, and there are, some of them take
23 two or three days to see and therefore

1 they would have to go back to the Falls
2 to park their car and eat and be in the
3 motel and if they had these trolleys they
4 could have one pass and see all these
5 things. The fairs in Lewiston, there is
6 no way you can see that in one day, you
7 have to stay a couple of days. So that
8 if you could just work on the trolleys,
9 then our tourists can leave here saying
10 that we have so much, Canada has nothing.

11 MR. SHIBLEY: Your modification is to
12 consider an alternative like a trolley
13 Thank you very much.

14 DON TAYLOR, M.D.: Dr. Don Taylor,
15 (inaudible.). I'm going up and down the
16 parkway for the past forty-one years,
17 starting off when it was a little curvy
18 road, and then a beautiful four-lane
19 parkway, and then back to a little curvey
20 road again, and so we're going back in
21 time. I know the fastest routes between
22 Lewiston and the Memorial Hospital is
23 going down the parkway. I know also that

1 this area has one of the highest
2 incidences of heart disease in the United
3 States, and we are also in the upper ten
4 for strokes. There is a time of
5 opportunity when a person can be helped,
6 which usually is one to two hours from
7 the onset of symptoms. And it is
8 important that the patient get to the
9 hospital, and it is important that the
10 hospital be accessible to take care of
11 the needs of the community. Getting rid
12 of the parkway is going to eliminate the
13 corridor, the main corridor to the
14 hospital to help save lives. That is
15 something that we should not certainly
16 get rid of.

17 MR. SHIBLEY: I want to capture this I think
18 in the spirit in which it is intended,
19 which I understand is one of the specific
20 things has to do with emergency services
21 and vehicles in relationship to them, to
22 ensure, particularly in the case of
23 hospital trips.

1 DON TAYLOR, M.D.: I think in planning of any
2 city or town, one of the first thing is
3 to make the hospital accessible so that
4 it can meet the needs of he community.

5 MR. SHIBLEY: Thank you very much, sir.
6 Paul, over here. Paul, you're not going
7 to make a speech, you're going to respond
8 to a minor modification, right?

9 SPEAKER: I'm not going to say more than
10 other people have said. First of all,
11 sir, have you heard of St. Mary's
12 Hospital?

13 MR. SHIBLEY: Please do not direct other
14 speakers, and keep your thoughts on the
15 project.

16 SPEAKER: 1960 -- excuse me, sir, it is my
17 turn to speak. In 1960 when the park was
18 constructed it went right through
19 Prospect Park, and to get into the park
20 you had to cross over overpasses, bridges
21 which were dangerous forcing senior
22 citizens and anyone who had health
23 issues, but that is how you got into the

1 park. The cars went through there
2 fifty-five miles an hour even in the
3 winter when ice forms on that road, which
4 made it dangerous. So they finally
5 decided in the late '70s to remove that
6 section of the parkway in Prospect Park.
7 Well, take a walk in there now folks, it
8 is beautiful and that is what those of us
9 who advocate to have it all the way down
10 to Lewiston along the gorge, a world
11 class park for people to enjoy attached
12 to the City of Niagara Falls, which is
13 next to it. Thank you.

14 MR. SHIBLEY: Folks, to remind you again that
15 you should be speaking to the news print
16 so that we can record it, you don't have
17 to challenge one another. All the ideas
18 offered here are our welcome.

19 STEVE HOLSON: Steve Holson. I'd like to say
20 that when the parkway was changed to a
21 two-lane highway I think some
22 opportunities were missed and I think,
23 for example, at the Devil Hole's Park

1 there is a two-lane road and it is a
2 convoluted series of access for the
3 southbound and less for the northbound,
4 and you have a pedestrian bridge, and I
5 know a lot of stuff could be done in
6 either context of the two-lane parkway or
7 removing the parkway connecting these
8 places to make this access a little bit
9 better.

10 MR. SHIBLEY: Thank you very much, sir.

11 JEFF HAUGH: Good evening, Jeff Haugh,
12 Wilson, New York. I'm holding right here
13 a Xerox copy of Niagara Falls Gazette
14 front page, the front page dateline is,
15 Power Project Secrets Out. This is
16 Friday, July 8th, 2005. And the article
17 says, the front page, Gazette, top secret
18 documents could render Niagara Power
19 Project vulnerable to a terrorist attack
20 were readily handed over to the Gazette
21 within the past (inaudible) agent hired
22 by New York Power Authority. Documents
23 contained detailed maps, diagrams and

1 description to cripple power generating
2 facility from Niagara Falls to Lewiston,
3 documents officials refused to disclose
4 based on security concerns.

5 Now, I have attended those
6 relicensing meetings, I have numerous
7 copies of the CD that contains detailed
8 schematics at Niagara Power Project, I'd
9 like to point out that this headline
10 might have been seen by terrorist
11 organizations or might have been seen by
12 Tim McVay, homegrown terrorist, so I
13 would suggest that security concerns
14 about the Niagara Power Project be one of
15 the objectives. Thank you.

16 MR. SHIBLEY: Point taken. Thank you.

17 Minor adjustment? Getting new criteria.

18 BILL GIBEN: Bill Giben, Village of Lewiston,
19 former trustee, former mayor. Strong
20 advocate of regionalism, looking at
21 objective four talks about adjoining
22 communities, objective eight talks about
23 adjacent communities. None of the

1 objectives looked at the possibility,
2 except number nine, greenway's talked
3 about communities further to north, such
4 as Youngstown, Porter with Old Fort
5 Niagara and Tuscarora Park in Wilson.
6 And possibly there is another objective
7 that is proven should be done, the least
8 negative impact on areas beyond the gorge
9 corridors.

10 MR. SHIBLEY: Do you have a short suggestion,
11 a short description of about how to
12 improve objectives?

13 SPEAKER: Right. Robert, I really enjoyed
14 your comment on engineers can't manage
15 what they can't measure, and I definitely
16 think that they need to be looking at the
17 measurement of the surface ratios, they
18 need to be doing an analysis of that,
19 that is part A.

20 And B, you got binational economic
21 tourism as far as the seasonal
22 development consideration. I highly
23 recommend that you get your hands on this

1 book called Peddling Revolution, how
2 cyclists are changing American cities.
3 This looks at all the cities in United
4 States, as well as others Europe. Thank
5 you.

6 MR. SHIBLEY: We have a world record time for
7 you.

8 SPEAKER: I'm a resident of Youngstown for
9 twenty-four years and I bring a lot of
10 friends of mine that come in and they
11 really enjoy it. I tell them to get to
12 Lewiston, drive to Lewiston and stop for
13 lunch and take that road from Lewiston to
14 Youngstown along the river. A couple
15 years ago I approached our previous
16 senator and I said one of the problems is
17 when you're driving along that road there
18 is not many areas that are open that
19 people can actually see the water, see
20 the boats out there. And I thought was
21 it is not going along and cutting down a
22 bunch of trees, but the brush and trees
23 could be trimmed so that the parkway,

1 when you are riding along would be very
2 enjoyable as you go along.

3 And I had a situation where in our
4 residence that somebody called and they
5 had a bad injury and I had to get them to
6 the hospital and I got to tell you, I was
7 really upset with that road. We got to
8 get it open, open that other road and do
9 some of those other nice things, we have
10 to use both lanes. Thank you.

11 MR. SHIBLEY: That's a second review of an
12 aspect for the speed relative to a
13 medical emergency. Thank you, sir. And
14 I think there was another performance
15 aspect here he was working with, which is
16 to really think about the view corridor
17 to the gorge as we work here and do
18 whatever we do here.

19 JEFFREY WILLIAM: Jeffrey William. I grew
20 up and live in Lewiston. Mine falls in
21 the minor adjustment category, it echoes
22 the last speaker, as well as five
23 speakers prior, I believe, on access. I

1 don't think it went far enough. I
2 believe that in the adjustment category
3 access is very important to the gorge rim
4 and to allowing people who live in those
5 neighborhoods, specifically the gorge
6 neighborhood in Lewiston and the Deveux
7 neighborhood in Niagara Falls, and also
8 the Orchard Parkway children. I believe
9 that the walls that were created, the
10 fences that were put up and the walls
11 that were put up to protect those
12 neighborhoods from the parkway are
13 actually the issue that are blocking our
14 residents and all of us from enjoying the
15 access that we really deserve. And I
16 believe that we -- no one has spoken up
17 enough about access to the gorge, whether
18 there is a road or not a road, whether it
19 is a meandering two-lane road or no road,
20 access is the actual issue and so to
21 focus on access is extremely important.

22 MR. SHIBLEY: Access, access, access. Ladies
23 and gentlemen, again, I want to get us to

1 sharpen these objectives. If you have
2 already heard it, we don't need to hear
3 it again, it has been recorded. We'll
4 keep working from there.

5 JOAN DAVIS: Joan Davis. I live in the
6 Town of Lewiston, half a mile down from
7 Mount St. Mary's Hospital and we own
8 property in Niagara Falls down on 4th and
9 Buffalo Avenue. My mother and
10 mother-in-law live in Niagara Falls so we
11 are frequently making trips back and
12 forth between Lewiston and Niagara Falls.
13 One of the huge issues I have is number
14 two and number three in regards to
15 vehicular traffic because we were having
16 access from the overpass by St. Mary's
17 onto -- coming home -- I don't want to
18 confuse anybody, coming home from the
19 Falls to Lewiston there was an exit onto
20 the overpass by St. Mary's Hospital, that
21 has been closed for years. If we don't
22 exit at that temporary so-called
23 temporary exit by Niagara University, if

1 you're daydreaming, or as you get older
2 you tend to lose your train of thought,
3 if you miss that you're down into the
4 Village of Lewiston. So that is about
5 six to seven miles out of your way, again
6 on a forty mile an hour highway, two-lane
7 highway, if you get behind someone going
8 twenty-five miles, which happens going
9 both ways, it can be very, very
10 aggravating, especially if you get a 911
11 call that your mom has a medical
12 emergency and you're trying to get up
13 into the city.

14 So I can go on ad nauseam on all
15 these issues, everybody else is aware of
16 all the same things, I think we need to
17 go back to where we were when the four
18 lanes were open.

19 MR. SHIBLEY: You're asking us to look at the
20 number two and number three more
21 carefully. Thank you very much.

22 JOAN JOHNSON: Good evening. My name is Joan
23 Johnson and I am from the Town of

1 Niagara, and I have income property in
2 Niagara Falls. More than thirty years
3 ago my father talked about over and over
4 again how he could not understand how
5 Niagara Falls had no access to any of its
6 waterfront, and he would say it just
7 wasn't practical and they were wasting
8 this very valuable asset. So here we are
9 still talking about it again.

10 MR. SHIBLEY: Go to a specific suggestion and
11 help us out.

12 JOAN JOHNSON: We remove the parkway from
13 Rainbow Bridge to Lewiston, replace it
14 with bicycle trails and hiking trails,
15 you can also have brief historical
16 recreations, you could have just all
17 kinds of things.

18 MR. SHIBLEY: So modifications. Folks, we're
19 not going there. So modification, you're
20 suggesting is a clearer articulation of
21 that kind of performance going to the
22 park for the corridor. Thank you.

23 CHRISTINE VENTRY: Christine Ventry. I have

1 two properties on Lewiston Road, many
2 years ago as a film producer I was
3 working on a specific production and I
4 met Robert Moses, and I want you to know
5 that Robert Moses is here tonight and
6 he's watching, and one of the things he
7 said, which was wonderful, he said, you
8 know, Christina, he said sometimes people
9 are innovative and have ideas, but
10 sometimes they don't have the guts to do
11 what we did with the Robert Moses
12 Parkway. He said, but what is going to
13 happen is this, the City of Niagara Falls
14 is going to rise from the ashes and we're
15 going to have a magnificent city and the
16 Robert Moses Parkway is going to be
17 indeed a fabulous road. So don't close
18 the Robert Moses Parkway, ladies and
19 gentlemen, Mr. Moses would be very angry.

20 MR. SHIBLEY: Go ahead.

21 TERRY DAVIS: Terry Davis, Lewiston, I was
22 born and raised in the Falls. I've got
23 many family members in the Falls and am

1 constantly going back and forth. I find
2 it a little aggravating a lot of times
3 when there is a bus up in front of me for
4 tourists and you can't pass, going slow
5 and there is a no passing law in there,
6 it is only forty miles an hour, half the
7 time people are site-seeing and are not
8 going forty miles an hour, and then you
9 turn around and you look and you see two
10 lanes on the other side of the road not
11 being used with weeds growing up, there
12 is maybe a couple joggers. Why not give
13 them a bike path? Give them a bike path
14 and be happy. Open up the other side to
15 another two lanes and you have got good
16 communication.

17 MR. SHIBLEY: Thank you. This gentleman is
18 going to fall over, he's been great.
19 And, folks, we're going to need to move
20 on to the next series of questions.
21 There are several opportunities to weigh
22 in. I do want you to be sure to write
23 down your comments, there is a clear

1 invitation to do that with the cards, as
2 well.

3 SEAN KELLY: Sean Kelly from Porter, mouth
4 of the Robert Moses. I have three
5 reasons why I think we should restore the
6 Robert Moses to its original state. One
7 is for transportation and commerce.
8 Number two is the historical significance
9 of the parkway itself. And lastly, the
10 access issue. It is not just access for
11 local citizens of Niagara Falls. I'm a
12 New York State taxpayer, I have a right,
13 it is not their private property or
14 playground. I have a right to access
15 that corridor just as much as everybody
16 else. So it is nice to be able to drive
17 down that corridor looking at the foliage
18 and enjoying the view and I have a lot of
19 childhood memories and that's one of the
20 reasons I moved back at my age. So I
21 think it is important that they restore
22 and take those barriers down so that
23 people can enjoy it for what it was

1 originally intended to be, what the
2 architects originally envisioned that
3 corridor to be. I think it is a
4 beautiful place to experience.

5 MR. SHIBLEY: We now have heard from a fair
6 number of folks who think it is basically
7 sound, and some have made concrete
8 suggestions for minor adjustment, and
9 some other folks that want us to sort of
10 throw it out. And there is another
11 category here which is, is there anything
12 we haven't heard about what is wrong with
13 these objectives?

14 SPEAKER: I haven't heard anything about
15 money. We have such a long history in
16 this community, and all of the areas,
17 we're getting wonderful ideas coming out,
18 we have people coming out with very
19 creative designs, and there is no money
20 to pay for them. You hear how in New
21 York State all the parks being closed.
22 Here in Lewiston we were in danger of
23 losing Joseph Davis State Park there for

1 a while. This is -- the park sticker is
2 on the bottom of that film right there.
3 Who is going to take care of all of this
4 no matter what the decision is?

5 MR. SHIBLEY: You're looking at the economic
6 case for whatever we're going to do.

7 Thank you.

8 ROBIN KAZER: Robin Kazer. I think I'm
9 actually one of the minorities that has
10 moved into Niagara Falls in the last five
11 years. I don't think anyone here is
12 clarifying that whether the road is
13 removed or not, how much development are
14 we talking about putting in here? Are we
15 talking about hotels and casinos and
16 everything like what you mentioned
17 earlier, or is there something that is
18 going to be a small scale development?
19 It is not clear. So it is too soon to
20 tell right now until we have that
21 clarification.

22 MR. SHIBLEY: Excellent. So again in the
23 objective category, what is the capacity

1 that we are aspiring to in this. This
2 gentleman was also patient.

3 JOHN HUTCHINS: John Hutchins. I live in
4 Lewiston and have a business on Main
5 Street. No one -- I believe the
6 objective should address the economic and
7 commercial impact that any changes are
8 going to make to the -- to the parkway.
9 I -- I believe, and this is in the
10 interest of keeping this short, that a
11 really good compromise would be very
12 similar to what Chris Brown stated
13 earlier, end the parkway, the four-lane
14 part of it at Finley Drive. Also, along
15 the way, for example, there is an exit by
16 Niagara University but you can't get on,
17 and that's been the problem with the
18 parkway all along, there is points you
19 can get off, you can't get back on. It
20 was poorly engineered from the get-go.
21 If it was closed at Finley, and then the
22 flow-through traffic just goes down
23 Whirlpool. In case anyone hasn't

1 noticed, there is a ton of boarded up
2 buildings on Main Street. We need -- we
3 need this objective, one of the
4 objectives to be to get people who are
5 looking for the commercial enterprises in
6 Niagara Falls to be able to get to them
7 quickly from Lewiston and Youngstown and
8 vice versa.

9 MR. SHIBLEY: I'm going to ask people to
10 raise your hands only if you have
11 something new to bring into the group.

12 SPEAKER: Definitely new. I'm coming at it
13 from a different angle.

14 MR. SHIBLEY: Thank you, sir.

15 ANTHONY GRANNA: My name is Dr. Anthony
16 Granna. I'm on the parkway preservation
17 committee, I'm also one of the Grass Root
18 Groups to preserve Deveux and more
19 importantly I live on Lewiston Road for
20 the last fifty years. And to enhance
21 what I wanted to say I'm going quote,
22 what the Niagara Heritage Partnerships,
23 one of the leaders as recent as October

1 27th, 2010, I like to quote an article
2 verbatim. State Parks have documented
3 two hundred thirty-one thousand seven
4 hundred sixty-eight tons of carbon
5 emissions annually from vehicles using
6 the gorge parkway and this is a toxic
7 assault on the ecological systems that
8 would be eliminated with total gorge
9 parkway removal. Let's discuss that a
10 little further. I can do it in two or
11 three minutes.

12 MR. SHIBLEY: Well, no, you don't want to do
13 two or three minutes.

14 DR. GRANNA: I will read it real fast, in a
15 minute. Closing of the parkway will not
16 eliminate CO2 emissions, it will merely
17 displace the same carbon emissions a few
18 yards to the east on Route 104 at
19 Lewiston Road, it will displace.
20 Furthermore, talking to engineers the
21 vehicles that come through Lewiston Road
22 have to stop and go and the carbon
23 emissions will be greater than that on

1 the parkway. Furthermore, displaces CO2
2 and other harmful emissions into a
3 densely populated residential area.
4 Another reason for not displacing traffic
5 from the parkway to Route 104 is traffic
6 density and safety through a highly
7 densely populated neighborhood. I can go
8 on and on.

9 MR. SHIBLEY: Take advantage of the carbon
10 analysis and be more thoughtful about it.
11 Everybody is being patient. I understand
12 the problem we have here, right.

13 EMERY SIMON: Emery Simon. I have a
14 successful construction business for the
15 last twenty some years. I think that
16 what you have is a good idea going, I
17 think that instead of looking one way or
18 another I think you should be looking at
19 a compromise. I travel to Canada all the
20 time, I see what they have done and I
21 think we learn from what the Canadians
22 have done. I think we can all learn from
23 the past. When I was growing up here,

1 when all my friends were all moving away
2 because they couldn't get jobs here was
3 because of the fact that they closed the
4 parkway. I'd like everybody to think for
5 a minute if you took the 190 around
6 Buffalo and you closed that off, nobody
7 likes to be forced to go somewhere. When
8 the parkway was opened you could use it
9 for business, pleasure, et cetera. I
10 think that the parkway is extremely
11 underutilized because of the fact that
12 you could -- you got the walking path
13 there. You could compromise and hit
14 every single point that everybody has
15 brought up here. And the woman brought
16 up, the young lady brought up a real good
17 point about financing. I think that
18 money would be a nonissue if the power
19 project was to pay for, this is the
20 driveway to their facility and they're
21 obviously not picking up on that.

22 MR. SHIBLEY: Thank you very much. Listen,
23 you're all being very patient. We have

1 less than a half an hour. We have other
2 devices to get at this and it is useful
3 to sharpen the text. You have given us
4 narratives, some of them quite
5 repetitive, but we have captured that and
6 we need to take a look at something else.
7 Asking you to attend the measuring stick
8 for this project as it gets modified as
9 we work through it. Here I'm asking you
10 to sort of weigh in on which one of these
11 is the most offensive to you, which one
12 of these would you most likely like to
13 see go away as an objective. And in --
14 and in this case if you choose to not
15 mark any of them, that is fine. Just to
16 give us an idea of if there is one of
17 these things that seems more offensive
18 than the other, one which one is it? I'm
19 going to ask the other question the other
20 way, whether there is one of these that
21 seems more right than the rest. And this
22 is just again a way to kind of give this
23 feedback on how sharpen these objectives.

1 Point of clarification for number
2 one, remove excess transportation. Put
3 that into the category of getting rid of
4 the parkway. That's the way this
5 conversation is being done. I'm just
6 describing -- basically they are trying
7 put this in performance terms, you're
8 being too precise about it. If it
9 offends you, by all means mark it. The
10 question has to do with making all four
11 lanes go away.

12 SPEAKER: Excess transportation
13 infrastructure, two lanes are being used
14 for traffic.

15 MR. SHIBLEY: I can't answer the question and
16 that is a good reason to be concerned.
17 So if you want to take it to another
18 level and say that's the one I'm most
19 worried about, say so. But it is like,
20 you know, we've heard it described now a
21 couple of times, take it out, leave it
22 in. I think that is the more or less a
23 take it out one. The idea here is if you

1 see one you don't like you can mark it
2 and it will call us to bring attention
3 and we'll start talking about how to
4 write it correctly, if that's the way
5 we're going.

6 SPEAKER: We don't understand the objective
7 then, it needs to be clarified.

8 MR. SHIBLEY: If it is too painful to sort of
9 say I like one of these better than the
10 other or I dislike one of these more than
11 the other, we can pass on that and get on
12 to other things.

13 SPEAKER: What if you don't like any of
14 them?

15 MR. SHIBLEY: We voted on that, that was the
16 last round, fatally flawed, should start
17 over. I don't like any of them, that's
18 what that means. So we're there. Don't
19 get tense about it. They're confusing, I
20 know they're confusing, that's why I am
21 trying to sharpen them.

22 SPEAKER: Does number one mean remove it or
23 leave it?

1 MR. SHIBLEY: If you refer or are meaning it
2 should be taken away, that means remove
3 it. It doesn't go backwards.

4 SPEAKER: You're asking for the objective to
5 change?

6 MR. SHIBLEY: I want to make sure this stays
7 useful to you and you're aiming this team
8 to do the right thing here. So if you
9 have positive suggestions, that will be
10 helpful to us. Let's cut down on the
11 sidebar because it is getting tough to
12 have a good record of everything.

13 SPEAKER: My question and my comment would
14 clarify number one and I've not heard a
15 single thing mentioned about actually
16 usage of the two lanes that are currently
17 operational. I've not run into a traffic
18 jam on the Robert Moses, so that is my
19 comment for the record.

20 MR. SHIBLEY: Look, this is the message loud
21 and clear, telling us exactly what you
22 mean by number one. That is what you're
23 saying there, tell us what you mean by

1 number one. This gentleman is very
2 patient, as well.

3 DONALD DIFIZIO: Donald DiFizio. I've lived
4 on Lewiston Road for forty-four years. I
5 have walked the parkway for twenty-five
6 years. What I haven't heard mentioned is
7 the fact, and the Welland man mentioned
8 how we could polish it, but how do we do
9 that? And I think one of the things that
10 disturbed me all the time was the fact
11 that you couldn't pull off the park and
12 have a picnic, there was no tables on
13 either side. Doing things like that will
14 enhance it without spending a ton of
15 money. It sounds like to me we're trying
16 to reinvent the wheel. And the way the
17 questions were made in the part before
18 this, you could take it either way, they
19 are really not distinctive. So I would
20 say improve the access as far as making
21 it a parkway that is it not a speedway,
22 so that the tourists can enjoy, see the
23 falls, cut the grass so you can see

1 the -- wen I was walking they stopped
2 cutting the grass and we couldn't see the
3 GORGE after.

4 MR. SHIBLEY: That is interesting. Thank you
5 very much. Kind of where we are, I would
6 like you to just weigh in for a moment on
7 whether there is any of these that you
8 really like.

9 SPEAKER: No.

10 MR. SHIBLEY: Let's see what your colleagues
11 say, give them a chance and register in,
12 you might be surprised. We're trying to
13 take your temperature with regard to this
14 range. And it is getting hot in here.

15 SPEAKER: Which one of those says you want
16 to keep the parkway?

17 MR. SHIBLEY: It was recorded by the various
18 task groups that Don presented, so that
19 is on the table clearly and it is clearly
20 put on the table here. Let's see where
21 we are. Some of these I can see you like
22 better than the others, and making that
23 crystal clear to us is very important.

1 DICK SOLURI: Dick Soluri. I think many of
2 you know me and are tired of listening to
3 me, but I have been an advocate to
4 retain the parkway for twelve years.
5 Although my term as mayor has expired,
6 I'm still working hard for all of us. I
7 am a native of the Falls, I grew up
8 downtown in the Falls, I saw the Falls in
9 its best days. But for my links between
10 key destinations, that must be parks, the
11 eleven state parks. How else would we go
12 to the parks if we didn't have the
13 parkway.

14 The other thing is why would the
15 state or the federal government want to
16 diminish the millions of dollars that
17 have been spent in Lewiston, Youngstown,
18 Wilson and beyond, state work grants, DEC
19 grants, costal resources grants,
20 Department of Transportation grants,
21 grants from congress, grants from the
22 state senate, grants from the assembly,
23 why throw all that money away? Does that

1 make any sense? No. Why diminish the
2 value of Lewiston Landing, Center Street,
3 the wine trail, Fantima Shine, the
4 Hickory Stick golf course, of farm
5 stands, the Lockport Locks, Old Fort
6 Niagara, and the potential new inn at Old
7 Fort Niagara, Wilson Harbor, Olcott
8 Beach, Youngstown Beach. (Inaudible.)

9 MR. SHIBLEY: Folks, we only have fifteen
10 minutes, so I would sort of encourage you
11 to sort of weigh in on these quickly and
12 there is one in particular that I'm going
13 to want you to look at that I think will
14 get us to a place of some closure.
15 Tonight's meeting, how much did you learn
16 about the process of scoping and corridor
17 project? This is the exam part, the idea
18 is, do you understand the sequence of
19 events that occurs? Just at the
20 beginning we are capturing from the
21 conversation anything that is heard and
22 what is not heard gets written down and
23 we will view later.

1 But let's weigh in on this very
2 quickly and let's see whether you
3 understand the scoping process.

4 If we're there then I'm going to ask
5 you other questions, which is the
6 lollapalooza. Tonight's meeting how much
7 did you learn about the process of
8 scoping and corridor project, a lot,
9 something new, only a little bit, I
10 didn't learn anything, I don't know.
11 And that is because some of us have been
12 around the block a hundred times before
13 and some us -- or some of you found it a
14 little too mechanical and terms of
15 presentation, but I guess that's the
16 process that we have to go through.

17 Let me take the next one and this
18 should make you, I think, happier.
19 Tonight's meeting I had a chance to speak
20 my mind? We heard a lot of different
21 points of views and opinions, did we hear
22 one that is even remotely consistent with
23 yours? And then -- and then that will be

1 maybe a little bit, or a lot of it, but
2 was sort of the way I was thinking about
3 things, or I fully feel like I have had
4 an opportunity to express my opinions,
5 whether it is here in speech or whether
6 you are writing it on the comment card,
7 which we will all read.

8 So the issue is how are he doing
9 with regard to trying to make these
10 conversations, or at least get the value
11 of input into the conversations from the
12 group. And this is our report card,
13 we will be interested to see how you feel
14 about it.

15 Thirty-eight percent are in the
16 ballpark on I'm feeling heard. Another
17 thirty-one percent I got a little in but
18 I don't think I got enough. Please
19 answer the survey, write to us, there
20 will be an e-mail and you can throw
21 things to us.

22 Those of you who said not at all
23 would include that gentleman in the back

1 with his hand up waiving probably. Here,
2 challenge us to something new.

3 SPEAKER: Something new. I live at 4336
4 Lewiston Road. Even though I am not a
5 stakeholder, my wife and I decided eight
6 year ago to stay in Niagara Falls, we
7 bought a house on Lewiston Road. It was
8 a substantial investment, we have
9 invested money and I have concerns about
10 the additional traffic that is going down
11 my street, my street, my investment, my
12 personal investment. I love the gorge, I
13 love the neighborhood, all that stuff, I
14 think the access could be improved. I
15 think our challenge here is to come up
16 with a compromise that makes everybody
17 happy can. (Inaudible.) Improving the
18 access and hopefully not sending every
19 one of those cars down my street because
20 I have a family too. Thank you.

21 MR. SHIBLEY: Look at the traffic impact,
22 that's where you are going there.

23 I want to ask those folks who don't

1 think they learned anything at all, if
2 there is something in particular that we
3 could or should do to sharpen the
4 delivery of this kind of information
5 going forward. If you got a specific
6 answer to that, leave your hand up. I
7 bet you didn't come with that answer.

8 SPEAKER: Amar, Niagara Falls High School.

9 MR. SHIBLEY: Welcome. And if you said that
10 I would have brought you up front.

11 SPEAKER: What I want to say is that I think
12 all the people are saying that they want
13 to see the nature and the gorge and that
14 road is the poison that is destroying it.
15 So if you want to see the nature why are
16 you letting the road poison it in the
17 first place. Eventually nature will be
18 destroyed and there will be nothing left
19 to see.

20 Second of all, there are alternative
21 routes to Lewiston, we researched it all.
22 And there is Hyde Park Boulevard,
23 Lewiston Road, there are alternative

1 routes to go there.

2 And third of all, our city,
3 everything is moving away, right?

4 Well, the Robert Moses Parkway allows
5 people to go around our city and when
6 people don't go through the city that
7 city starts to die.

8 MR. SHIBLEY: Both points mentioned, thank
9 you. Ladies and gentlemen, here is the
10 big one, this is what we are really
11 trying to get at here. I've heard a
12 couple of people say compromise.
13 Compromise sounds like, I lose a little,
14 you lose a little. The question is, can
15 you find an approach to the gorge
16 corridor that we're all proud of? Is it
17 possible to find an approach to the gorge
18 corridor where we are all proud of it?
19 All of the objectives can help us get
20 there. We can find a solution that will
21 help us fulfill all the objectives.
22 This is important, study this question,
23 I'm going to come back to it.

1 (Inaudible.).

2 I believe we can find a solution
3 that will fulfill all of the, objectives
4 some of the objectives, balance of
5 competing objectives, some objectives to
6 the exclusion of others, and I think some
7 other outcome is likely.

8 This is a complicated question, but
9 literally saying, wait a minute, these
10 things are not as opposing as they seem.
11 They are written in a way that suggests
12 compromise, which is what you're
13 resisting, and I get that. But is it
14 possible this get all of the objectives
15 done or modify objectives the way we're
16 talking about? Some or most of them, a
17 balance, some objectives to the exclusion
18 of others, I think some other outcome is
19 likely. Weigh in, please.

20 Looks like the weight of this is a
21 balance of competing objectives maybe, or
22 some objectives to the exclusion of
23 others. Some of you believe, maybe two

1 or three or four or five, that all of the
2 objectives can be addressed. About
3 seventeen percent think some or most of
4 them can be fulfilled in this process.
5 But the vast majority believe we're going
6 to get some and not others. That is the
7 kind of face-off that we're into here.

8 It looks a little bit like this
9 other question, this is a variation on
10 the same thing. We'll stop after this
11 one and have some more question and
12 answer. Make everybody happy, it is
13 possible. Satisfy most people. Please
14 some people, but anger others.
15 Disappoint most everybody. I have a
16 different expectation.

17 So is it possible we will find the
18 solution to the Niagara Gorge Corridor
19 that will make everybody happy, satisfy
20 most people, please some people, but that
21 has to do with, can we work through this.
22 Can we get a gorge project we're all
23 proud of? This is very much unlike

1 court. They always ask question they
2 know the answers to, I'm asking questions
3 I don't know how it is going to turn out.

4 This sounds like it is not
5 possible for us to find a solution that
6 will actually get us to a point where all
7 of us are proud of the actions taken. It
8 is not possible. Anybody think it is?
9 Somebody does. One percent, who is the
10 one percent?

11 SPEAKER: I think it is possible. About
12 thirty-three seconds after it was first
13 suggested twelve years ago that the
14 entire gorge parkway should be removed,
15 then Mayor Soluri (inaudible.) You might
16 have been entertained here this evening.
17 I didn't find it entertaining at all, you
18 know why, because most of these inventive
19 conclusions I heard here over the last
20 hour-and-a-half or whatever, I have heard
21 them over the last twelve years, and most
22 of those questions have been answered,
23 except those who oppose removal of the

1 parkway do not give the removal argument
2 the respect to go and check out what the
3 specifics are, or you wouldn't still be
4 talking about a compromise this, two-lane
5 that, where is that money going to come
6 from. All these questions have been
7 answered. (Inaudible.)

8 MR. SHIBLEY: Not going there, folks. Here
9 is my last line for you. The political
10 piece here is a very large, looks like a
11 Canadian goose, with his shoes on, and
12 the second page of the political piece
13 here takes you to the crow standing on
14 the soap box with an axe. That is the
15 sixty-eight percent scenario. This
16 process doesn't have to be like that.
17 (Inaudible) information on the table. We
18 are supposed to draw from this new things
19 that you brought to us in terms of
20 sharpening the set of objectives that we
21 engaged in, so there is a lot more work
22 to do.

23 There is a group of people that will

1 be interested and eager to get the values
2 and positions. They have no interest in
3 making a bad decision here. They want to
4 understand community values and put it to
5 work in the corridor.

6 So write on the piece of paper and
7 be sure to drop it off. Write to the
8 corridor project, you can e-mail to them,
9 there is a web page. Please, do what you
10 can do. Thank you very much for your
11 time. I'm very sorry, but we are out of
12 time tonight.

13
14 * * * * *
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

STATE OF NEW YORK)

SS:

COUNTY OF NIAGARA)

I, ANDREA P. EGOLF, a Notary Public
in and for the State of New York, County of
Niagara, DO HEREBY CERTIFY that the
proceedings were taken down by me in a
verbatim manner by means of Machine Shorthand
on November 30, 2010.

I further CERTIFY that the
above-described transcript constitutes a true
and accurate transcript of the proceedings.

ANDREA P. EGOLF,
Notary Public.